

STATE OF COLORADO COLORADO CIVIL RIGHTS COMMISSION	RECEIVED  OCT 09 2018  OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE COURTS  ^ COURT USE ONLY ^
AUTUMN SCARDINA, Complainant,  v.  MASTERPIECE CAKESHOP INCORPORATED and JACK PHILLIPS, Respondents.	
<b>NOTICE OF HEARING AND FORMAL COMPLAINT</b>	

**YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED** pursuant to § 24-34-306(4) C.R.S., that a hearing will be held before an Administrative Law Judge at 9:00 a.m. on **Monday February 4, 2019** on the fourth floor at the Office of Administrative Courts, 1525 Sherman Street, Denver, Colorado 80203, to determine whether Respondents violated § 24-34-601 *et seq.*, C.R.S. (2018) by denying Complainant Autumn Scardina (Scardina) the full and equal enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages and accommodations at its place of public accommodation because of Scardina's sexual orientation (transgender status).

Pursuant to the authority set forth in §§ 24-34-305(1)(d) and 24-34-306(4), C.R.S. (2018), the Colorado Civil Rights Commission (Commission), having determined that the circumstances warrant a hearing, hereby charges and alleges as follows:

1. Respondent, Masterpiece Cakeshop Incorporated (Masterpiece or "the bakery"), is a bakery that engages in sales of goods and services to the public. Masterpiece is a place of public accommodation as defined by § 24-34-601(1), C.R.S., and is therefore subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission.

2. Respondent, Jack Phillips (Phillips) is the owner and operator of Masterpiece, and is a person as defined by §24-34-301(5)(a), C.R.S. As Masterpiece's owner, Phillips is responsible for providing the full and equal enjoyment of its goods and services to the public regardless of protected class, and is therefore subject to the jurisdiction of the Commission.

3. Timeliness and all other jurisdictional and procedural requirements of title 24, article 34, parts 3 and 4 have been satisfied.

4. Upon information and belief, on June 26, 2017, Scardina contacted Masterpiece by telephone to order a cake to celebrate her birthday. Scardina asked if the bakery sold made-to-order birthday cakes. The individual on the phone answered in the affirmative and asked for the date of her birthday. Scardina responded that it was on July 6th and asked if that would be enough time to make the cake. Masterpiece's representative indicated that that the bakery could accommodate that timing.

5. Upon information and belief, Scardina requested a cake with a blue exterior and a pink interior, and indicated that she would need a cake big enough to serve 6-8 people.

6. Upon information and belief, Masterpiece's representative stated that the bakery would make the cake as requested by Scardina. Scardina then mentioned that the design was a reflection of the fact that she had transitioned from male to female and that she had come out as transgender on her birthday. Masterpiece's representative then stated that the bakery would not make the cake as requested by Scardina because it does not make cakes to celebrate a sex-change and terminated the call.

7. Upon information and belief, Scardina called Masterpiece back and spoke to a different individual about the exchange that took place during her initial call and confirmed that the cake she had ordered was to celebrate her birthday. Masterpiece's representative responded that the bakery would not make a cake for Scardina and terminated the call.

8. On July 20, 2017, Scardina filed a charge of discrimination with the Colorado Civil Rights Division alleging that Respondents discriminated against her in a place of public accommodation based on her sex (female) and/or sexual orientation (transgender status).

9. During the Colorado Civil Rights Division's investigation of the charge, Phillips affirmed his employees' decision to not fulfill Scardina's order, and cited his religious beliefs as the reason why the bakery would not do so.

10. Upon information and belief, the bakery sells made-to-order birthday cakes to non-transgendered individuals.

11. On June 28, 2018, following the investigation, the Division Director's authorized designee found probable cause for crediting the allegations of the charge

that Masterpiece discriminated against Scardina in a place of public accommodation based on her sexual orientation (transgender status).

12. As required by § 24-34-306(2)(b)(II), C.R.S. (2018), the Division Director's authorized designee ordered the parties to attempt amicable resolution of the charge by compulsory mediation.

13. Upon information and belief, efforts to resolve the matter amicably through the ordered mediation have been unsuccessful.

14. On October 2, 2018, the Commission voted to notice this matter for a hearing and to file this formal complaint.

15. The Commission alleges that Masterpiece denied service to Scardina based on her sexual orientation (transgender status), as defined by § 24-34-301(7), C.R.S. (2018), in a violation of § 24-34-601(2)(a), C.R.S. (2018).

16. The Commission further alleges that Masterpiece is not a place that is principally used for religious purposes, as contemplated by § 24-34-601(1), C.R.S. (2018).

The Commission seeks the following relief:

1. That Masterpiece and Phillips be ordered to allow Scardina and all customers that seek goods and services from the bakery, the full use and enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages, and/or accommodations of this place of public accommodation, regardless of their sexual orientation.

2. That Masterpiece and Phillips be ordered to cease and desist their practices of discriminating against persons based on their sexual orientation and to immediately discontinue their policy and practice of refusing to provide goods and services to persons due to their sexual orientation.

3. That Masterpiece and Phillips be ordered to adopt a corrective policy which will allow Scardina and other similarly situated persons the full and equal enjoyment of the goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages or accommodations provided by the bakery regardless of their sexual orientation.

4. That Masterpiece and Phillips be ordered to report to the Commission all remedial action taken to eliminate the discriminatory practices until such time as it has been established that all discriminatory practices have ceased.

5. That Masterpiece and Phillips be ordered not to retaliate against Scardina in any way.

6. That Masterpiece and Phillips be ordered to provide any other relief which may be available to Scardina by virtue of operation of law and any other relief the Commission deems just and proper.

Masterpiece and Phillips may file a verified answer prior to the date of the hearing. The hearing will be conducted pursuant to sections 24-34-306 and 24-4-105, C.R.S. (2018). Failure to answer the complaint at hearing may result in entry of default judgment against Masterpiece and Phillips.

Dated this 9<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2018.

BY THE COMMISSION:

  
COMMISSIONER

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This is to certify that I have duly served the within **NOTICE OF HEARING AND FORMAL COMPLAINT** upon all parties herein by depositing copies of same in the United States mail, first-class postage prepaid, at Denver, Colorado, this 9 day of October, 2018 addressed as follows:

Autumn Scardina  
7779 Everett Way  
Arvada, CO 80005

John McHugh  
Reilly Pozner LLP  
1700 Lincoln Street, Suite 3400  
Denver, CO 80203

Masterpiece Cakeshop, Incorporated  
3355 S. Wadsworth Blvd., H-117  
Lakewood, CO 80227

Jacob Warner, Esq.  
Alliance Defending Freedom  
15100 N. 90<sup>th</sup> St.  
Scottsdale, AZ 85260

By interdepartmental mailing services, copies were sent to:

Matthew Azer  
Director/Chief ALJ  
Office of Administrative Courts  
1525 Sherman St, 4th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203

Michelle Brissette Miller  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Employment/Personnel & Civil Rights Unit  
Civil Litigation & Employment Law Section  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203

By Hand Delivery for filing on October 9, 2018:

Office of Administrative Courts  
1525 Sherman St, 4th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203

Adriana Camonec